
Rahim Shah*1, *, Ghazala Parveen2, Maria Shoukat1, Sofia Khalid3, Abdul Hameed1

1Department of Microbiology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan
2Biological Production Division, National Institute of Health (NIH), Islamabad, Pakistan
3Department of Environmental Sciences, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

**Key words:** Pathogen, Gastrointestinal disease, Seasonal outbreaks, Endemic, Antibiotic resistant strains

http://dx.doi.org/10.12692/ijb/11.3.135-147 Article published on September 27, 2017

**Abstract**

*Vibrio Cholera*, causative agent of acute gastrointestinal disease or cholera is a natural inhabitant of aquatic environment. Cholera is endemic disease in Latin America, Southern Asia and parts of Africa, where poor sanitation and seasonal outbreaks are particularly associated with seasonal outbreaks. Large number of outbreaks of *Vibrio cholera* gastroenteritis in Asian countries indicates the need to evaluate the prevalence of that pathogenic species in different regions of Asia. This study was conducted to ascertain the prevalence and antibiotic resistance of *Vibrio cholera* in the endemic areas of Pakistan. Samples were collected from epidemic cell of National Institute of Health (NIH) during the time period of July 1998 to 1999, on the basis of reported cases of gastroenteritis/ cholera infections. A total of 172 isolates were collected from the 303 stools and vomitus samples of infected patients and their sensitivity to 18 antimicrobial agents were determined by disk diffusion method. All the isolates of *Vibrio cholera* showed 100% resistance to streptomycin and trimethoprim/ sulfamethoxazole throughout the study period. The O139 strain isolated from water was resistant to streptomycin and Kanamycin. In contrast Norfloxicin were found to be very effective with only 4% resistance rate during 1998 while Tobramycin showed the best results with only 1% resistance as compared to resistance percentage of Tetracycline 10%, Erythromycin 16%, Chloramphenicol 17%, Cefamendol 40%, Ampicillin 58%, Nalidixic acid 66%, Nitrofurantion 95% during 1999. The comparison of antibiotic sensitivity showed almost similar pattern of antibiotics sensitivity with little variations due to geographical barriers. Furthermore, the trends of increased resistance to antibiotics indicate that indiscriminate use of antimicrobial agents during hospitalization and self-medication contributed to the emergence of drug resistance in the prevalent strain of *Vibrio cholera*.

*Corresponding Author:* Rahim Shah  rshaw_75@yahoo.com
Introduction

Cholera is a gastroenteritis infections resulting in millions of deaths worldwide caused by enterotoxin-producing *Vibrio cholera* (Berger, 2017). It remains a perennial health problem most of the developing countries presenting in sporadic, endemic, epidemic proportions and resulting in significant mortality and morbidity. Cholera has affected approximately 3–5 million people worldwide and resulted in 28,800–130,000 deaths per year (Hatti-Kaul and Mattiasson, 2016; Lozano *et al*., 2013). Now it is categorized as a pandemic disease, rarely found in developed world (Reidl and Klose, 2002).

The death rate was greater than 3 million a year in the early 1980s. Still it is difficult to determine the exact numbers of cases of infection, due to misconception of having negative impact on tourism of a country (Sack and Bradley, 2006). *Cholera* infection mostly occurs as both chronically and outbreaks having status of both endemic and epidemic. Globally, areas with high risk of disease include south-east Asia and Africa with a death rate of 5% which may increase up to 50% among patients who do not prefer treatment (Dobre *et al*., 2014). From 1984 -2014, approximately 13,000 cases of Cholera infection were reported to the Cholera and Other Vibrio Illness Surveillance (COVIS) (Crowe *et al*., 2016). According to WHO each year from 2007-2011, >100 000 cases of cholera was reported by 20 African countries with annual case-fatality ratios (CFRs) from 2.22% to 2.95% (Mintz and Tauxe, 2013).

The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) reported that consumption of undercooked oysters and see food increased the rate of infection since year 2001, specifying the need of practical measures to control human *Vibrio* infections (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2010).

The cholera epidemic in Nigeria in 2010, with 41,787 reported cases with a case fatality rate (CFR) of 4.1%, was one of the biggest outbreaks in Nigeria, with 80% of reported cases attributed to children and women (Adagbada *et al*., 2012; Dalhat *et al*., 2014).

*Vibrio cholerae* is transmitted to humans through contaminated food and water. In Pakistan Diarrhea infection rate is found to be about 15% (Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia, 2017).

The Ministry of Health in Pakistan reported 99 cases of *Vibrio cholera 01* in different regions of the country. These cases of infections were confirmed by the laboratory of National Institute of Health until 30 September 2010 since after flood rains.

These infections were reported sporadically from different geographical regions of the country including flood-affected areas of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh (Guo *et al*., 2017). Aquatic environments are the best habitat of *Vibrio cholera* (Islam *et al*., 1993).

The primary symptoms of disease include painless and profuse diarrhea and vomiting of clear fluid (Ansaruzzaman *et al*., 2004). These symptoms generally appear after 0.5-5 days of bacterial ingestion (Azman *et al*., 2012). An untreated patient with cholera infection may produce 10-20L of diarrhea per day. If the patient is not properly treated, it can lead to severe and life threatening electrolyte imbalance and dehydration (Baracchini *et al*., 2016; Faruque *et al*., 2004).

Antimicrobial therapy plays an important role to overcome the effects of diarrhea by reducing the duration of symptoms, excretion of vibrios in the feces therefore shortening the volume of diarrhea. The ciprofloxacin-trimethoprim combination have additive and synergistic effects against *Vibrio cholera* (Mandal *et al*., 2012).

Keeping in view the risk factors and associated losses, the present study was conducted with the aim to know the occurrence of *Vibrio cholerae* responsible for diarrhea in Pakistan including regions of Gilgit, Rawalpindi and its adjoining areas and Afghanistan. Furthermore to engender information concerning the effectiveness of commercially available antibiotic against *Vibrio cholerae*.
Table 1. Zone diameter interpretive Chart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serial No.</th>
<th>Antimicrobial agent</th>
<th>Disc Potency</th>
<th>Resistant</th>
<th>Intermediate</th>
<th>Susceptible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Ampicillin (AM-AMP)</td>
<td>10-25μg</td>
<td>≤13</td>
<td>14-16</td>
<td>≥17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Cefamendol (MAN)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤14</td>
<td>15-17</td>
<td>≥18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Cefotaximin (CTX)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤14</td>
<td>15-22</td>
<td>≥23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Ceftriazone</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤13</td>
<td>14-20</td>
<td>≥21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Chloramphenicol (CH)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤12</td>
<td>13-17</td>
<td>≥18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Ciproflaxcin</td>
<td>5μg</td>
<td>≤15</td>
<td>16-20</td>
<td>≥21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole (SXT)</td>
<td>1.2μg</td>
<td>≤10</td>
<td>11-15</td>
<td>≥16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Enoxicin (ENX)</td>
<td>23.75μg</td>
<td>≤</td>
<td></td>
<td>≥</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Erythromycin (E)</td>
<td>10μg</td>
<td>≤14</td>
<td>15-17</td>
<td>≥18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Kanamycin (K)</td>
<td>15μg</td>
<td>≤13</td>
<td>14-16</td>
<td>≥17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Nitrofurantion (FD)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤14</td>
<td>15-16</td>
<td>≥17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Nalidixic Acid (NA)</td>
<td>300μg</td>
<td>≤13</td>
<td>14-18</td>
<td>≥19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Norfloxacin (NOR)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤12</td>
<td>13-16</td>
<td>≥17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Ofloxicin (OFX)</td>
<td>10μg</td>
<td>≤12</td>
<td>13-15</td>
<td>≥16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Polymyxin-B (POL-B)</td>
<td>50μg</td>
<td>≤08</td>
<td>09-11</td>
<td>≥12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Streptomycin (ST)</td>
<td>300μg</td>
<td>≤06</td>
<td>07-09</td>
<td>≥10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Tetracycline (TET)</td>
<td>30μg</td>
<td>≤14</td>
<td>15-18</td>
<td>≥19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Tobramycin (MN)</td>
<td>10μg</td>
<td>≤12</td>
<td>13-14</td>
<td>≥15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Biochemical characterization of isolates of Vibrio cholera.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Result</th>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Gram Staining</td>
<td>Gram negative</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Motility in distilled water</td>
<td>-ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shape</td>
<td>Comma shaped</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Motility in NaCl 80g/L</td>
<td>-ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Oxidase Test</td>
<td>+ve</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Motility in NaCl 100g/L</td>
<td>+ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Catalase Test</td>
<td>+ve</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Motility in NaCl free peptone water</td>
<td>+ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Urea hydrolysis</td>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Agglutination with O1 group Vibrio cholera antiserum</td>
<td>+ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Indole Test</td>
<td>+ve</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Hydrogen Sulfide production</td>
<td>-ve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Vogus proskeur test</td>
<td>+ve</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Growth and color changes on Citrate</td>
<td>-ve</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Materials and methods

Sampling of Vibrio cholerae

This cross-sectional research study was designed on patients with the sign and history of dysentery, diarrhea, and excessive dehydration between July 1998 to 1999. A total of 303 stool and vomitus samples were collected from Epidemic cell of National Institute of Health (NIH), Islamabad, Pakistan on the basis of reported cases of gastroenteritis/cholera infections in people from all over the country including Rawalpindi, Islamabad, Gilgit and Afghanistan.

Samples were collected in sterile containers with proper labelling and data sheet and transported to Bacteriology Laboratory of Public Health Division under aseptic conditions for further processing and analysis.

Isolation, identification and characterization of Vibrio cholerae

For the purpose of isolation of pathogens, the stool samples were inoculated on the nutrient agar plates by swabbing and incubated for 24 hours at 37°C.
The colonies obtained on nutrient agar were further purified by streaking on Mac Conkey’s agar, Blood agar (BA), Thiosulfate citrate bile salts sucrose (TCBS) agar plates and incubated at 37°C for 24-48 hours. The purified organisms were selected for further analysis (Sperandio et al., 1995). Identification was accomplished on the basis of results of microscopic examination of stained smear through Gram staining and cultural appearances and characteristics on different media.

Table 3. In vitro susceptibility of clinical isolates of V. cholerae to different antimicrobial agents during 1998.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Antimicrobial agents</th>
<th>Number of isolates</th>
<th>Resistant (%)</th>
<th>Intermediate (%)</th>
<th>Susceptible (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Kanamycin</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>92.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Streptomycin</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Chloramphenicol</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>90.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Erythromycin</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Norfloxacin</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>96.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Nalidixic acid</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33.85</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>96.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. In-vitro susceptibility (%) of clinical isolates of Vibrio cholerae to different antimicrobial agents during 1999.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Antimicrobial agents</th>
<th>Number of isolates</th>
<th>Resistant (%)</th>
<th>Intermediate (%)</th>
<th>Susceptible (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Tetracycline</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>9.92</td>
<td>13.74</td>
<td>76.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Norfloxacin</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>99.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Nitrofurantion</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>94.74</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Ceftriazone</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>5.66</td>
<td>94.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Ciprofloxacin</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>6.29</td>
<td>93.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Ceftaxime</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>11.32</td>
<td>88.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Ofloxacin</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Erythromycin</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>15.73</td>
<td>83.15</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Chloramphenicol</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>17.16</td>
<td>70.15</td>
<td>12.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Nalidixic acid</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>65.71</td>
<td>21.71</td>
<td>13.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Streptomycin</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Ampicillin</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>58.06</td>
<td>30.65</td>
<td>11.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Cefamendol</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>39.51</td>
<td>19.75</td>
<td>40.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Kanamycin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Tobramycin</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>10.69</td>
<td>88.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Different biochemical test were performed to characterize the pathogen such as oxidase, Voges-Proskauer, methyl red, and triple iron sugar tests, hemolysis pattern and motility test (Barua, 1992; Cheesbrough, 1981; Srinivasan et al., 2011)(Ansaruzzaman et al., 1996; Cheesbrough, 1981; Noguerola and Blanch, 2008).
Antibiotic sensitivity testing
Antibiotic susceptibility was determined by the agar disc diffusion method also known as Kirby-Bauer method (Bauer et al., 1966) against 18 commonly used antibiotics by using the Muller-Hinton agar medium. This method is commonly used to determine the in vitro efficacy of commonly used antibacterial agents by measuring the specific length of the zone of inhibition, which is produced due to diffusion of agent into the medium surrounding the disc.

Table 5. Locality wise in vitro susceptibility of clinical isolates of Vibrio cholerae to different antimicrobial agents during 1998.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antimicrobial agents</th>
<th>Rawalpindi (adjacent areas)</th>
<th>Afghanistan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of isolates tested</td>
<td>Resistant (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanamycin</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streptomycin</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chloramphenicol</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erythromycin</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norfloxacin</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nalidixic acid</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The name of used antibacterial agents with their specific concentration per disc and the diameter of zone of inhibition are shown in Table 1.

Results
Isolation, identification and characterization of Vibrio cholerae
During 1998-1999, Specimens from 303 patients with diarrhea were cultured. A total of 170 Vibrio cholera strains were isolated from 303 stool and vomitus samples. Among these 170 cholera positive patients, 88 were males, 75 were female and 7 were of unknown gender.

During the two year period, 15.66% isolates were from children under the age of five years. 28% of isolates were from young child of 5-20 years and 8% from the age of over 60s. Results obtained from different biochemical tests showing the presence of Vibrio cholerae are shown in Table 2.

Seasonal and annual trend is illustrated in figure 1. It is observed that Cholera infections most commonly occur during the monsoon or flood season from June-August, when it is likely the contamination of water drinking sources with infested fecal material.

The reported data of two years 1998-1999 revealed that there is high risk of infection during the rainy season including July-September.

Susceptibility Testing
Strains variations were observed in susceptibility of Vibrio cholerae with increasing resistance to commonly used antimicrobial agents during the two year (1998-1999) period.

Norfloxacin and Nalidixic acid were found to be most effective drug against Vibrio cholerae, only 3.85% isolates were resistant to both antibiotics while Kanamycin and Chloramphenicol showed resistance rate of 7.14% and 9.1% respectively. Erythromycin was less effective because all the isolates showed resistance to it. Furthermore, Streptomycin and Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole showed high resistance rate and least effectivity (Table 3).

During 1999, most of the isolates of Vibrio cholerae were appeared to be as multi-drug resistant. Norfloxacin and Ofloxacin were found to be the most effective drug against multi-drug resistant isolates. Ceftriazone and Ciprofloxacin are also observed to be effective drugs with intermediate resistance rate of 5.66% and 6.29% respectively.
Chloramphenicol, Erythromycin and Nitrofurantion proved to be less effective antibiotics because less than 15% isolates were susceptible to them while in case of Streptomycin and Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole, all the tested isolates were resistant (Table 4).

**Locality wise susceptibility pattern**

During 1998 all the isolates were obtained from Afghanistan, Rawalpindi and its adjacent areas as shown in Table 5. Nalidixic acid Norfloxicin and kanamycin were observed to be effective drugs for the isolates of Afghanistan with 10.05% susceptibility rate as compared to Rawalpindi and its adjacent areas where all the isolates were immediately resistant to Chloramphenicol while Erythromycin, trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole and streptomycin were found totally resistant to both regions.

**Table 6.** Locality wise in vitro susceptibility of clinical isolates of *Vibrio cholerae* to different antimicrobial agents during 1999.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antimicrobial agents</th>
<th>Gilgit</th>
<th>Afghanistan</th>
<th>Rawalpindi (adjacent area)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of isolates</td>
<td>Susceptible (%)</td>
<td>Intermediate (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tetracycline</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>96.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norfloxicin</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nitrofurantion</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceftriazone</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>5.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ciprofloxacin</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>11.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cefotaxime</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>5.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ofloxicin</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erythromycin</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>87.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chloramphenicol</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>20.75</td>
<td>77.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nalidixic acid</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>71.70</td>
<td>28.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streptomycin</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ampicillin</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>64.44</td>
<td>28.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobramycin</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>8.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cefamendol</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During 1999, all the isolates were susceptible to Norfloxacin, Ciprofloxacin and Ofloxacin with 100% susceptibility rate as demonstrated in Table 6.

Tetracycline was found to be the 2nd most effective drug in Gilgit, Afghanistan and Rawalpindi with susceptibility rate of 96.23%, 89.47, and 54.25% respectively. Similarly Tobramycin was found to be the 3rd most effective drug in Rawalpindi, Gilgit and Afghanistan with susceptibility rate of 91.43%, 88.89%, 69.23% respectively while Cefamendol, Ampicillin, Nalidixic acid and Chloramphenicol were proved to be less effective because more than 50% of the isolates showed resistance against these drugs. Furthermore all the isolates were resistant to Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole and Nitrofurantion.
Temporal Changes in Antibiotic Susceptibility of Vibrio cholerae

Temporal Changes in antibiotic susceptibility of Vibrio cholera from July 1998 to October 1999 were also studied. Isolates of 1999 were found to be most resistant to chloramphenicol and Nalidixic acid with 88.43% and 87.31% respectively as compared to resistance pattern of isolates obtained during 1998 with resistance rate of 3.85% and 9.1% respectively. Kanamycin was found to be 2nd most resistant drug with 50% and 7.14% resistance rate during 1999 and 1998 respectively. No significant antibiotic susceptibility changes were observed in isolates of Vibrio cholera against Norfloxacin, Streptomycin, Trimethoprim, Sulfamethoxazole and Erythromycin within two year period (Table 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antimicrobial agent</th>
<th>Resistance (%) during 1998</th>
<th>Resistance (%) during 1999</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kanamycin</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streptomycin</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chloramphenicol</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>87.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erythromycin</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norfloxacin</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>0.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nalidixic Acid</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>88.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Antibiotic susceptibility of Isolates from Water Sample

Two isolates of vibrio cholera were separated from water sample, O139 and Non-O1. Both strains of Vibrio cholera were susceptible to Chloramphenicol, Norfloxacin, Nalidixic acid, Kanamycin, Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole, Enoxin and Tobramycin. Both strains were immediately resistant to Erythromycin and Streptomycin (Table 8).

Discussion

Results obtained from random sampling of patients showed an incident rate of 46% and 54% in women and male respectively which is similar to previous findings (Sheikh et al., 1997). This incidence rate was also reported in several other studies (Mahalanabis et al., 1994; Nitsure et al., 1997). The high rate of infection in male population is due to outdoor activities and exposure to contaminated environment. With regard to seasonal variation, it has been demonstrated that most of the cases occur during summer (Wilcox et al., 1992). In the present study maximum isolates of 120 were isolated in the month of August followed by 29 in July 11 in June. Similar reports were also shown in previous data (Sheikh et al., 1997; Nitsure et al., 1997).

According to Deb et al., (1979) the source of infection could be the rainfall in abundant summer season when the average temperature ranges between 25-40ºC, that is the optimal range of temperature for the survival of Vibrio cholerae. Cholera is also known as disease of young children. Over the last two years 18.9% of the isolates were from the children under the age of 5 years.

The 33.6% of isolates were from children of 5-20 years (Deb et al., 1979). However according to Sheikh et al., (1997), 44% of the isolates were from the children under the age of 5 years, 12% from young of 5-20 years and 12% from patients over the age of 60 years (Sheikh et al., 1997), The first characterized isolates of O139 strains were from Madras in January 1992 (Albert, 1996). Vibrio cholerae O1 biotype ELT reappeared in 1993 and became the dominant serotype and replace the O139, established itself in Karachi in 1993 (Fisher-Hoch et al., 1993) and disappeared in 1996. It is proposed that the dramatic decrease in prevalence of Vibrio cholerae O139 were associated with changes for example in colonization factor that determine long term persistence in aquatic environment (Faruque et al., 1997).
Studies in Bangladesh indicated that the O139 serotype survived better than the O1 strain in aquatic environment (Islam et al., 1993; Khan et al., 1988; Sheikh et al., 1997).

Antibiotic Susceptibility

Generally most of Vibrio cholera isolates are susceptible to Vibriocidals, Penicillin, Cephalosporin, Quinolone, Aminoglycosides, Lincosides, Antibiomimetics, Tetracycline, Sulfonamides and Cotrimoxazole but it is still a clinically significant pathogen due to its resistance to many agents. Widespread use and misuse of antibiotics imposes immense selective pressure for the emergence of antibiotic resistance in bacteria and as a consequence the development of antibiotic is inevitable (Gillespie and Skurray, 1987). Effects to control infectious disease more comprehensively are undermined not only by socioeconomic conditions but also by nature of pathogenicity of pathogen. Isolates of infectious diseases have become so resistant to antimicrobial drugs by horizontal gene transfer that they are almost untreatable (Fuchs, 1998).

Table 8. Antibiotic susceptibility pattern of Vibrio cholerae strains isolated from water samples during 1998.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strain</th>
<th>Date of isolation</th>
<th>O serotype</th>
<th>Antibiogram</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NE 46</td>
<td>06-7-98</td>
<td>Vibrio cholera 0139</td>
<td>CH^,+NOR^,+NA^,-, K^,-, SXT^,-, ENX^,-, TOB^,-, ST^,-, E^1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NE 124</td>
<td>13-08-98</td>
<td>Vibrio cholera Non-O1</td>
<td>CH^,+NOR^,+NA^,-, K^,-, SXT^,-, ENX^,-, TOB^,-, ST^,-, E^1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CH= Chloramphenicol; Nor= Norfloxicin; NA= Nalidixic Acid; K= Kanamycin; SXT=Trimethoprim/ sulfamethoxazole; ENX= Enoxicin, TOB=Tobramycin, ST=Streptomycin, I= Intermediate resistant; S= Susceptible; R= Resistant.

In the present study strain variation was observed in the changing antibiograms of isolates over the period of observation with increasing resistance to commonly used antibiotics. The resistance strains have also been reported from Russia, India, Africa and South America (Mhalu et al., 1979; Sundaram and Murthy, 1984; Tabtieng et al., 1989; Ved’mina et al., 1984; Weber et al., 1994).

Among the penicillin group, Ampicillin was tested against 124 isolates, 41.94% strains were almost immediately resistant and 58.06% were totally resistant. Cortinoot et al., (1995) observed that 16.5% of strains of Vibrio cholera were resistant to Ampicillin from around the world. Several studies were carried out in India and found a dramatic increase in resistance of Vibrio cholerae to Ampicillin between the period of 1992-94 (Mukhopadhyay et al., 1995). Plasmid born resistant strains to Streptomycin and Kanamycin was found in Vibrio cholerae O1 ELT or isolates involved in a major epidemic in 1985-86 in the Horn of Africa, same results were demonstrated by later studies in Ecuador. The sensitivity of Kanamycin in the present study is contradictory to results of Coppo et al., (1995) and Weber et al., (1994). The geographical barriers, medications of antibiotics uses and seasonal variations are the possible reasons of difference in resistance rate.

Chloramphenicol, a Lincosamides is very active against gram negative bacteria. In the present study 90.9% of isolates were sensitive to it during 1998 while only 12.69% of isolates showed sensitivity to during 1999 while in previous study carried out by Sheikh et al., (1997), it was found that 92% of the total isolates were sensitive to Chloramphenicol during 1992-1993. Similar results were reported by Nitsure et al., (1997) while Khan et al., (1989) also found 100% sensitivity of isolates against Chloramphenicol.
In previous reports 100% isolates of *Vibrio cholera* were resistant to Trimethoprim/Sulfamethoxazole which is commonly being used against gastroenteritis (Sheikh et al., 1997). All the similar results have been previously reported by different researchers favor the outcomes of present study (Sheikh et al., 1997; Khan et al., 1988). The complete resistance against this group of drugs signifies the fast and appropriate diagnosis between cholera and other gastroenteritis, which otherwise unnecessary delay may result in the death of the patients.

The Quinalones group has been widely used against wide range of gram negative bacterial infections. From this group of antibiotics, Nalidixic acid, Norfloxicin and Ciprofloxacin were tested against isolates of *Vibrio cholera*. Almost all the isolates (96.15%) were sensitive to Nalidixic acid and Norfloxicin during 1998. These findings coincide with the previous studies carried out by Sheikh et al., (1979).

Erythromycin, a macrolides, was noted to be resistant to *Vibrio cholerae* during the present study. All isolated strains of *Vibrio cholera* were intermediate resistant during 1998 while in the next year some of the strains were totally resistant to it. Tetracycline is demonstrated to be an effective drug against *Vibrio cholera*, 76.34% of isolates were sensitive to it. These results showed similarities with the previous reports demonstrated by Khan et al., (1989).

Among the Antibiomimetics group, Nitrofurantion was investigated and all the isolates showed resistance against it. Antibiotics from Cephalosporin group including Cefamendol, Cefotaxime, Ceftriazone and were tested against *Vibrio cholerae* and sensitivity rate was found to be 40.74%, 86.68% and 94.34% respectively.

*Vibrio cholerae* from Aquatic environment were studied because several epidemiological studies reveal that it is a best source for the sporadic and epidemic diseases (Islam et al., 1993). For that purpose water samples were also studies. Out of 76 water samples two were positive for 0139 Ogawa and no-01 Inaba. Recently large number of epidemics are reported by these strains in Pakistan (Sheikh et al., 1997), Bangladesh (Albert, 1996) and India (Ramamurthy et al., 1993). The serogroup 0139 survive better than 01 strain in the aquatic environment under stress conditions (Khan et al., 1989). The 0139 strain was found sensitive to Chloramphenicol, Tobramycin, Enoxacin, Norfloxicin, Nalidixic acid and Cotrimoxazole while sensitive to Streptomycin and Kanamycin and intermediately resistant to Erythromycin.
The second isolate from water sample was non-01 Inaba not agglutinated with 01 polyvalent antiserum. It was also sensitive to Chloramphenicol, Tobramycin, Enoxacin, Norfloxacin, Nalidixic acid, Cotrimoxazole and Kanamycin while resistant to Streptomycin and intermediate resistant to Erythromycin.

The population size for the isolation of *Vibrio cholerae* and their susceptibility pattern were studied from relatively large geographical area including Rawalpindi (adjacent areas), Gilgit and Afghanistan. Throughout the study, same pattern of antibiograms was observed in all these regions except few variations e.g. Chloramphenicol; in 1998 the isolates selected from Afghanistan were resistant to it in contrast to isolates of Rawalpindi region with intermediate sensitivity. Same variations were also observed during 1999 in susceptibility pattern of *Vibrio cholerae* to Tetracycline and Chloramphenicol. Isolates obtained from Rawalpindi and Gilgit were most sensitive to the respective antibiotics while the isolates of Afghanistan were most sensitive to Nalidixic acid and Cefamandole as compared to those of Rawalpindi and Gilgit region (Okeke et al., 2005).

**Conclusions**
The findings obtained from this study will help to understand the distribution of antibiotic resistant strains, define suitable monitoring programs, and to provide evidence for assessing the exposure of this pathogen at the consumption sites. Ofloxacin, Norfloxacin and Nalidixic acid were found to be most effective drug against *Vibrio cholerae*, with highest susceptibility rate and effectiveness.

**References**


Mintz ED, Tauxe RV. 2013. Cholera in Africa: a closer look and a time for action. Journal of Infectious Diseases, 208(suppl 1), S4-S7. https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jit205

Mukhopadhyay A. 1995. Distribution and virulence of Vibrio cholerae belonging to serogroups other than O1 and O139: a nationwide survey. Epidemiology and Infection, 114(01), 65-70. Available at: www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2271350/


www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/8119348


www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC495024